

**CTF Proposal
for
Vietnam: Strengthening Sustainable Urban Transport for Ha Noi Metro Line 3 Project
COMMENTS MATRIX**

COMMENTS	ACTION TAKEN
Germany	
<p>1. Comments on the Project Proposal: Urban Public Transportation is a key issue to address GHG emission reduction. The use of private vehicles (motorbikes, cars) in Vietnam is massively increasing, which entails increasing road congestion, reduced road safety and increasing greenhouse gas emissions. Extension of urban public transport systems (such as the Ha Noi Metro lines) is a reasonable approach to this problem. Integrating public transport systems and ensuring their easy accessibility to attract customers is important to ensure utilization of the system.</p>	Agreed
<p>2. The proposal makes the rationale for the investment project clear. The ensuing investment project is part of the CTF Investment Plan. It is additional, but in line with the Ha Noi Urban Transport Master Plan. The proposal does not explicitly argue why grant funding is necessary, but it is understood that PPTA is usually provided through grant funds.</p>	Preparation of the project will propose innovative and transformational measures to improve public transport in Ha Noi, including inclusive and gender features, which would not usually be considered by Ha Noi agencies. Use of grant funds for the PPTA encourages the government to utilize these more advanced measures, rather than following “low tech” or basic solutions that are typical for Viet Nam.
<p>3. Potential for GHG Emissions Savings: The PPTA itself will not contribute to emission savings. The proposal does not provide information on the emission savings targeted with the ensuing investment project</p>	The actual emission savings under the investment project could not be accurately estimated at this stage, as could vary widely depending on the actual measures adopted, which will be determined under the PPTA.
<p>4. Demonstration potential at scale: Replicability of the investment project concept is possible, but limited at this time: A first replication is planned for an urban rail system currently being planned in Ho Chi Minh City. Further replication is possible in other districts of Ha Noi. It must be noted, however, that other Vietnamese cities are to date not large enough that urban rail systems are being implemented. There is potential for replication in other Asian countries.</p>	The current project is expected to directly affect about 5% of Ha Noi greater urban area. Replication is expected for the other three metro lines under early stages of implementation, and another 2 metro to be completed by 2025. Replication of the “non-MRT” aspects is also possible in several of Viet Nam’s medium sized cities. Through knowledge dissemination and exchange, this can potentially be expanded to replicate for Cambodia and Laos.
<p>5. Development Impact: The proposal does not quote impacts, but the following outputs (which, again, refer to the ensuing investment project):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - strengthened implementation capacity for metro line 3 - improved accessibility features in and around metro stations; 	The <u>outcome</u> of the outputs under the investment project will encourage the development of an integrated public transport system for five districts of Ha Noi, which will lead to the <u>impacts</u> that Ha Noi can more likely achieve the public transport usage targets of over 40% (by 2025).

COMMENTS	ACTION TAKEN
<p>- integrated and innovative public transport services and measures connecting to metro stations;</p> <p>- support for transformational policies and regulatory measures to encourage modal shift to public transportation modes..</p> <p>6. No absolute figures of the expected additional customers etc. are quoted. This may be due to the fact that such figures could be part of the output of the PPTA. Nevertheless, a rough estimate of this figure as well as of the estimated GHG emissions saved should have been provided in the proposal.</p> <p>7. We would like to commend the GoV and MDB-Team for paying particular attention to development impacts, including gender aspects. The stakeholder consultations of consultants for the design of the ensuing project will be of heightened relevance.</p> <p>8. Implementation Potential: We do not see major implementation risks with the PPTA, as the objectives of the project are aligned with those of Government of Vietnam and Ha Noi city.</p>	<p>As current comprehensive urban transport information is lacking, so provision of absolute figure would have been misleading at this stage, especially as multiple factors will impact these targets (building infrastructure will have less impact if necessary policy changes do not also occur). However, it was broadly estimated that without integration, metro ridership could be 40% lower. For GHG see answer to item 4 above.</p> <p>Social and gender impacts are expected to be an integral part of design of investments and policy measures.</p> <p>Major risks relate to implementation of policies and changing users preference for private transport, but these risks are mitigated through strong commitment to future vision of high public transport targets in Ha Noi masterplan.</p>
<p>Japan</p> <p>3. The proposed CTF projects are acceptable and welcomed for JICA, given the conditions that detail TORs are to be consulted and adjusted in the field level with related TA projects conducted by JICA.</p> <p>4. JICA is providing financial supports by ODA loans for Metro Lines 1 and 2 in Hanoi City and Line 1 in HCMC. In addition, JICA is also providing the local authorities with the TA projects, some of which address the overall institutional issues such as establishing operation and maintenance companies, urban development in and around the UMRT stations. While frequent dialogues between ADB and JICA is being made in the field level, further close coordination and adjustment of TORs are expected so as to maximize the effects of TA interventions by the two agencies</p> <p>- The project on integrated UMRT and urban development for Hanoi in Vietnam (HAIMUD Phase I) (completed in 2011). Implementing Agency (IA):Hanoi Peoples Committee. (The final reports are available in JICA Web site and have been shared with ADB Hanoi and AFD Hanoi already)</p>	<p>JICA staff will be consulted during finalization of the TORs to ensure the projects complement and work with related TA projects conducted by JICA.</p> <p>ADB is well aware of the listed JICA TA projects in Ha Noi and has been working closely with the consultants for the indicated projects during development of relevant urban transport, attending relevant meetings and seminars provided by JICA.</p> <p>ADB and JICA regularly attend the bi-annual donor meeting for Ha Noi urban transport, for wider coordination with other agencies active in Ha Noi urban transport development.</p> <p>Further close coordination is expected between the PPTA consultants and JICA TA consultants, who will be shared copies of reports and invited to attend the two key tripartite meetings under the PPTA.</p>

COMMENTS	ACTION TAKEN
<ul style="list-style-type: none">- HAIMUD Phase II (2012 – 14, under discussion with Hanoi City). IA: Dept of Transport, Hanoi City).- Project for Improving Public Transportation in Hanoi (Ongoing, 2011 – 14). IA: TRAMOC, Hanoi City- Project for establish and agency managing the operation, maintenance and exploitation of metropolitan railway lines in Hanoi area (under preparation). IA: Hanoi Railway Board- Preparatory Survey on UMRT Line 5 (under preparation, 2011-12). IA: Ministry of Transport	