

August 6, 2012

Response from IBRD to Comments from Germany on Approval by mail: Impact Assessment of Clean Technology Fund in Renewable Energy and Energy Efficiency Market in Turkey

Dear Zhihong,
Please find attached our responses to German comments.
Regards,
Gevorg

Gevorg Sargsyan
Program Coordinator Climate Investment Funds (CTF, SREP)
Sustainable Energy Department, The World Bank

**Ina von Frantzius, Policy Advisor, Division Climate Policy and Climate Financing
Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development**

Thank you very much for the proposal, which we welcome very much. We think this is a very useful exercise and are very interested to see the outcome of this assessment. We would think that this kind of assessment could be interesting to be conducted for other IPs as well.

We welcome and approve the proposed Impact Assessment Study of CTF financed clean energy projects in Turkey

Additional remarks / suggestions:

- From the proposal it is not clear whether implementation of the three projects in question has been finalised.

Response:

The implementation of the Private Sector Renewable Energy and Energy Efficiency Project (IBRD) is under way. The CTF funds have been almost fully disbursed. The Sustainable Energy Financing Facility (EBRD) has as well disbursed nearly all CTF funds. The International Finance Corporation (IFC) is exploring for opportunities to allocate the remaining US\$ 20 million of CTF funds under the Commercializing Sustainable Energy Finance Program.

2. On V. Scope of Work / c.:

- If we are not mistaken, then the relevant results frameworks are not to be found in the investment plan, but in the project proposals.

Response:

Indeed, there is no result framework in the IP but instead individual projects have results frameworks.

- In addition to the project results framework, the consultant should also explicitly address the fulfillment of the CTF investment criteria and to which extent the projects have lived up to the expectations outlined at the time of project approval.

Response:

Agree. We have updated the scope of work in the terms of reference to include a request for the team of consultants to address the fulfillment of CTF investment criteria and objectives.

- Also, the extent of successful capacity building within and ownership of participating banks and other private sector players should be assessed: This is a proxy for the readiness of the sector to sustainably continue the activities kick-started with the CTF co-financed projects.

Response:

Agree. We have updated the scope of work in the terms of reference to include a request for the team of consultants to address the capacity building within and ownership of participating banks and other private sector players.

- The provided timeframe appears to be rather ambitious and is not up to date, since the provided table proposes the inception report to be due July, 27, 2012.

Response:

We have updated the timetable accordingly in the terms of reference (TOR) documents. Please find the revised timetable below.

Report	Deadline after effectiveness of contract	Notes/Contents
(i) Inception Report	August 31, 2012	This report shall include a methodology, indicators and work program.
(ii) Draft Report	October 5, 2012	The Draft Report should have all proposed indicators and interview results included in.
(iii) Final Report	October 26, 2012	The final report needs to be reviewed and approved by all relevant stakeholders.
(iv) Dissemination/ Presentation	November 1-7, 2012	The final draft of the study should be printed (about 500 copies) and the consultant should be prepared to provide a detailed presentation on the findings for the study.

- We welcome the planned assessment of the Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) system in Turkey along with the proposed subtasks.

Response:

Thank you.

- Furthermore we welcome the proposed dissemination of lessons learned from the implementation of the Private Sector Renewable Energy and Energy Efficiency project in Turkey regarding other similar operations globally.

Response:

Thank you.

- However, we wonder why an assessment and analysis of the impact of the CTF funding provided to the projects/programs in Turkey for the RE/EE market development in Turkey has not been systematically included to a certain extent in the preparation of the original investment plan from the outset?

Response:

The information on project related indicators and impacts is captured systematically on an ongoing basis. In addition, the preparation of the project implementation and completion report (ICR) will require a more in-depth analysis and update on project indicators and impact. The purpose of this analysis is to assess a broader impact that such operations might have in terms of scale up and achievement of CTF objective