

August 3, 2012

**Comments from Germany on Approval by Mail: Impact Assessment of Clean
Technology Fund in Renewable Energy and Energy Efficiency Market in Turkey
(EBRD, IBRD, IFC)**

Dear all,

thank you very much for the proposal, which we welcome very much. We think this is a very useful exercise and are very interested to see the outcome of this assessment. We would think that this kind of assessment could be interesting to be conducted for other IPs as well.

Please find our comments on the proposal in the enclosed document.

Kind regards

Ina von Frantzius

Ina von Frantzius

Referentin / *Policy Advisor*

Referat Klimapolitik und Finanzierung / *Division Climate Policy and Climate Financing*

Bundesministerium für Wirtschaftliche Zusammenarbeit und Entwicklung / *Federal
Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development*

German Comments regarding the funding by the Clean Technology Fund (CTF) for the Impact Assessment of CTF in Renewable Energy and Energy Efficiency Market in Turkey

The proposed activity aims to assess and analyze the impact of the CTF funding provided to the projects/programs in Turkey for the RE/EE market development in Turkey. Furthermore the study is to assess an overall assessment of the Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) system in the country.

We welcome and approve the proposed Impact Assessment Study of CTF financed clean energy projects in Turkey

Additional remarks / suggestions:

- From the proposal it is not clear whether implementation of the three projects in question has been finalised.

2. On V. Scope of Work / c.:

- If we are not mistaken, then the relevant results frameworks are not to be found in the investment plan, but in the project proposals.

- In addition to the project results framework, the consultant should also explicitly address the fulfilment of the CTF investment criteria and to which extent the projects have lived up to the expectations outlined at the time of project approval.

- Also, the extent of successful capacity building within and ownership of participating banks and other private sector players should be assessed: This is a proxy for the readiness of the sector to sustainably continue the activities kick-started with the CTF co-financed projects.

- The provided timeframe appears to be rather ambitious and is not up to date, since the provided table proposes the inception report to be due July, 27, 2012.

- We welcome the planned assessment of the Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) system in Turkey along with the proposed subtasks.

- Furthermore we welcome the proposed dissemination of lessons learned from the implementation of the Private Sector Renewable Energy and Energy Efficiency project in Turkey regarding other similar operations globally.

- However, we wonder why an assessment and analysis of the impact of the CTF funding provided to the projects/programs in Turkey for the RE/EE market development in Turkey has not been systematically been included to a certain extent in the preparation of the original investment plan from the outset?