

CAM: Greater Mekong Subregion Biodiversity Conservation Corridors Project
ADB response to the Comments Raised by the Sub Committee of the Pilot Program for Climate
Resilience (PPCR)
 17 September 2014

Comments	Responses
<p>Anna Bobin, Deputy Programme Manager, International and Sustainable Energy Teams, Climate and Environment Department Department for International Development United Kingdom</p>	
<p>The UK welcomes this project and is content to approve the funding. We are very pleased to see the focus on gender and ensuring that women are included in measures designed to improve their capacity to adapt to climate change. The project also has a strong focus on knowledge sharing and lesson learning which we welcome. It will be important to ensure that i) ADB's safeguard procedures are employed to ensure the most appropriate design and to mitigate the risk of potential negative impacts arising from sea defences, and ii) economically, sea defences have been appraised as the most viable and cost-effective option set against a range of alternatives.</p>	<p>Thank you for the comments. ADB's technical, social and environmental due diligence requirements were applied at the prefeasibility stage to determine technical and economic feasibility, and potential social and environmental impacts. The following frameworks for environment and social safeguards of the ongoing Project (PAM paras 47 to 52) have been updated to include scope of the PPCR-funded activities, including the sea barriers: (i) Environmental Assessment and Review Framework (Supplementary Appendix I); (ii) Resettlement Framework (Supplementary Appendix J) and Indigenous Peoples Planning Framework (Supplementary Appendix K). Since detailed design of the infrastructure interventions, including sea barriers, will be undertaken during implementation, they will be subject to an appropriate level of appraisal as part of due diligence to confirm their viability against a range of alternatives.</p>
<p>Taro Kimura, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Japan</p>	
<p>While the project document is eloquently written, it is not easy to understand the concrete contents of the project. It is indispensable to describe the actual work of the project in addition to the conceptual explanation. It appears that almost half of the budget (3,166 thousands USD) will be allocated to civil works which include sea barriers, rehabilitation of irrigation scheme, and rainwater harvesting ponds. As these are the important part of the project, it is necessary to mention at least the breakdown of the cost of each civil works.</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments and the request for clarification. The project is designed based on four interventions as described in the Summary Project Approval Request, the draft ADB Board Document and the draft Project Administration Manual.</p> <p>The project cost estimates, including contingencies, for packages of works, can be found in the procurement plan, page 51 of the Project Administration Manual. Base cost estimates for civil works (excluding contingencies) of the four subprojects are summarized as follows:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Sea barriers (5km): \$569,000 2. Irrigation rehabilitation (15km): \$620,000 3. Rainwater harvesting ponds (40 ponds): \$1,761,000 4. Ecosystem-based adaptation in pilot catchments (2 catchments): \$215,000 <p>Total = \$3,166,000</p>
<p>Dr. Romeo Bertolini Bundesministerium für wirtschaftliche Zusammenarbeit und Entwicklung Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development Sondereinheit Klima Special Unit on Climate, Germany</p>	

Comments	Responses
<p>With regards to the proposal, no objection from our side. We, however recommend to consider earlier comments on the revised SPCR for Cambodia, submitted on 22nd January 2014, as well as our comments made below (see bold highlights) during project implementation. Moreover, we appreciate the <i>Response from ADB—Approval by mail: Endorsement of Revised SPCR for Cambodia (PPCR)</i>, submitted on 6th February 2014.</p> <p>Individual Comments</p> <p>1. The <i>Promoting Climate-Resilient Agriculture in Koh Kong and Mondulakiri Provinces as part of the Greater Mekong Subregion Biodiversity Conservation Corridors (BCC) Project</i> foresees four interventions related to climate-resilient agriculture and water resources, which complement BCC Project’s regular activities financed from ADB. It seeks to increase adaptive capacity and reduce climate vulnerability of ecosystems and communities in the BCC Project area, as well as to support diversified livelihoods and income generating opportunities. The intended PPCR intervention is expected to strengthen to BCC Project’s intended overall impact, which is ‘climate-resilient sustainable forest ecosystems benefiting local livelihoods’. Given the major importance of agriculture and water resources for the livelihoods of large parts of the population, as well as the high vulnerability to climate change of these sectors (which has been highlighted in the National Adaptation Programme of Action (NAPA)), the overall approach of the proposed project seems to be meaningful in the Cambodian context. The project is based on previously conducted vulnerability assessments, includes an appropriate Monitoring Evaluation (M&E) system, and its results framework adequately refers to all five PPCR core indicators. In addition, the proposal mentions public private partnerships and private sector participation in three areas. Yet, as only two of these areas are described, we kindly suggest clarifying what the third area of public private partnerships and private sector participation will be.</p> <p>2. We appreciate that the proposed project is “consistent with the BCC Project’s impact, the country operations business plan (2014-2016), and government priorities, including the NAPA in agriculture and water resources” (p. 3). However, the project proposal does neither</p>	<p>Thank you for the no objection to the proposed project. Kindly see our responses to the three comments below.</p> <p>1. There was a typographical error in the PPCR Summary Project Approval Request. The first paragraph of page 13 under Public Private Partnerships and Private Sector Participation should read “<i>The activities funded by PPCR will promote public private partnerships and private sector participation in two [instead of three] areas: (i) cooperation with the NGO sector on community development and training; and (ii) development of a community forest enterprise.</i>”</p> <p>2. Footnote 4 of the ADB Board Document has been revised to confirm that the proposed project is aligned with the CCCSP 2014-2023 and the Sectoral Climate Change Strategic Plans of the Ministry of Environment, and Ministry of Environment (MOE) and Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries (MAFF). Paragraph 26 of the Project Administration Manual has been revised to reflect the same.</p> <p>The proposed project will contribute to two of the three goals of the CCCSP 2014-2023, namely (i) to reduce vulnerability to climate change impacts of people, in particular the most vulnerable, and critical systems (natural and societal) and (ii) to promote public awareness and participation in climate change response actions.</p> <p>More specifically, the proposed project will contribute to the following strategic objectives of the CCCSP 2014-2023:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Strategic objective 1. Promote climate resilience through improving food and water security by promoting climate-resilient crops (Interventions 1, 2 and 3 as described in page 6 of the PPCR Summary Project Approval Request). - Strategic objective 2. Reduce sectoral, gender vulnerability and health risks to climate change impacts by placing a strong emphasis on gender through the implementation of the gender action plan (Supplementary Appendix H to ADB Board Document and page 15 of the PPCR Summary Project Approval Request). - Strategic objective 3. Ensure climate resilience of critical ecosystems, biodiversity and protected areas. This is a main objective of the proposed project. As it is nested within the ongoing Biodiversity Conservation Corridors Project, it is one of the criteria to prioritize the proposed project interventions (Pages 4 and 5, PPCR Summary

Comments	Responses
<p>mention the Cambodia Climate Change Strategic Plan (CCCSP) 2014-2023, which captures the main strategic objectives and directions for a climate-resilient development of Cambodia in the next ten years, nor the Sectoral Climate Change Strategic Plans (SCCSPs), which focus on sector-specific responses to climate change. Thus, we recommend outlining if and how the proposed project is aligned to the Cambodia Climate Change Strategic Plan (CCCSP) 2014-2023 and to one or more of the Sectoral Climate Change Strategic Plans (SCCSPs).</p> <p>3. Moreover, despite the fact that two of the five intended results (1 and 2; corresponding to PPCR core indicators A2.1 and B2) are directly related to mainstreaming climate change adaptation, the proposal does not make any reference to the evolving National Adaptation Plan (NAP) Process in Cambodia. Thus, in line with our earlier comments on the revised SPCR, we recommend describing briefly how the proposed project fits into the context of the National Adaptation Plan (NAP) Process in Cambodia and how potential synergies between the foreseen interventions and the NAP Process can be exploited.</p>	<p>Project Approval Request).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Strategic objective 5. Improve capacities, knowledge and awareness for climate change responses through intensive training, preparation of case studies, knowledge products, and policy workshops (Pages 14 and 15 of the PPCR Summary Project Approval Request under "Information Generation and Knowledge Management"). - Strategic objective 6. Promote adaptive social protection and participatory approaches in reducing loss and damage due to climate change. All proposed interventions are the result of participation from the local communities to identify climate resilience options. Participation will be essential during project implementation. The project will build human resource capability and social capital through establishment of water users groups and forest conservation groups (description of the PPCR-funded interventions in pages 6 and 7, and section Stakeholder Consultation and Participation in page 13 of the PPCR Summary Project Approval Request). <p>The proposed project is also consistent with the strategic objectives 1, 2, 3, 5, and 6 of the SCCSP from MOE, and strategic objectives 2, 3, and 5 of the SCCSP from MAFF.</p> <p>3. As recorded in ADB's response to Germany and Spain's comments dated 6 February 2014, <i>Technical Assistance (TA) 8179: Mainstreaming Climate Resilience into Development Planning for Cambodia</i>, for which MOE is the executing agency, has four outputs (i) SPCR coordination and technical support to mainstreaming, (ii) feasibility studies for NAPA projects, (iii) civil society support mechanism, and (iv) knowledge dissemination. Collaboration with the NAP process will be ensured under output (ii) of the TA. The MOE, an executing agency of this proposed Project, is required to ensure close coordination between the Project and the TA team, especially under output (i) and output (ii), in exploiting synergies and contributing to the NAP process, among other things. In this context, the proposed Project will contribute to the NAP process by providing feedback, lessons learnt and data, most notably in modelling, projections, and vulnerability assessment (Supplementary Appendix M to the ADB Board Document), and monitoring and reporting (page 16 of the PPCR Summary Project Approval Request).</p>